Terminations for Convenience: HOW TO MAXIMIZE CONTRACTOR RECOVERY

GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION

PAUL J. SEIDMAN SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C.

NOVEMBER 13, 2017, 7 pm E.S.T. MONROE HALL, 2115 G. STREET, NW WASHINGTON, DC

Copyright © 2017 By Paul J. Seidman



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



RECOVERABLE COSTS – BASIC FORMULA

TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS



- Allowable cost + profit + settlement expense
- Subject to loss adjustment
 - Recovery = incurred costs X contract price/incurred costs + settlement expense

FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS

- % of price reflecting % of completion + reasonable charges resulting from T/C
- Loss adjustment implicit in Prong 1



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



RECOVERABLE COSTS FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS ALLOWABLE COST SUMMARY

- Prong 1 [price reflecting % of completion] requires payment for:
 - TriRad Technologies, Inc., ASBCA 58885, 15-1 BCA ¶ 35898
 - Completed items/work at contract price
 - Partially completed items/work based on % of physical completion
- Prong 2 [reasonable charges resulting from T/C]
 - SWR, Inc, ASBCA 56708, 15-1 BCA ¶ 35832 states:

The second prong . . . refers to the recovery of those charges incurred that "do not relate to work completed" but should be reimbursed to fairly compensate the contractor whose contract has been terminated.

- At least coextensive with FAR 31.205-42
- Other charges may also be recoverable



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



3

RECOVERABLE COSTS FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS ALLOWABLE COST SUMMARY

- Prong 1 [price reflecting % of completion] requires payment for:
 - TriRad Technologies, Inc., ASBCA 58885, 15-1 BCA ¶ 35898
 - Completed items/work at contract price
 - Partially completed items/work based on % of physical completion
- Prong 2 [reasonable charges resulting from T/C]
 - SWR, Inc, ASBCA 56708, 15-1 BCA ¶ 35832 states:

The second prong . . . refers to the recovery of those charges incurred that "do not relate to work completed" but should be reimbursed to fairly compensate the contractor whose contract has been terminated.

- At least coextensive with FAR 31.205-42
- Other charges may also be recoverable



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



RECOVERABLE COSTS TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS FAR 49.201 FAIR COMPENSATION RULE

"(a) A settlement should compensate the contractor fairly for the work done and the preparations made for the terminated portions of the contract, including a reasonable allowance for profit. * * * *

* * * *

(c) * * * * The amount of recordkeeping, reporting, and accounting * * * should be kept to a minimum compatible with the reasonable protection of the public interest."



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



5

RECOVERABLE COSTS TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS FAR 49.201 FAIR COMPENSATION RULE

- Codex v. U.S., 226 Ct. Cl. 693 (1981)
 - Contractor developed improvements to communications system for purpose of obtaining government contract
 - T/C just after award. CO disallows development expense as unallowable pre-contract cost
 - Court holds disallowance improper if it would have deprived contractor of fair compensation
- [SWR, Inc. ASBCA 56708, 15-1 BCA ¶35,832]
 - Holds Fair Compensation Principle Applicable to Commercial Item Contracts



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



- 1. DETERMINE IF REDUCTION A BREACH
- Breach entitles contractor to anticipatory profits
- Some Scenarios
 - No Termination Clause in Subcontract
 - Failure to Order Guaranteed Minimum
 - Failure to Order Needs Under Requirements Contract





SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



7

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES

- 2. CHARGE INDIRECT COSTS DIRECTLY
 - Direct charging necessary for "fair compensation"



- Traditional Government Contracts
 - No conflict with CAS 402
 - Not "like circumstances"

 DCAA Audit Manual, ¶ 12-105c
- FAR PT 12 CI Contracts
 - CAS and Cost Principles Inapplicable



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES 3. SEEK FAIR COMPENSATION

- Claim cost if disallowance is unfair
- Provide explanation referencing FAR 49.201 fair compensation principle



· Codex v US, supra.



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



9

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES

4. AVOID GOVERNMENT SECOND GUESSING



- Costs are often disallowed because auditor or CO would have acted differently
- Government may not substitute its judgment for that of the contractor
- Costs are allowable unless a clear abuse of discretion



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



5. REJECT IMPRACTICAL PROOF REQUIREMENTS

Traditional Government Contracts

- Not Required to Have Documentation for Cost-Reimbursement Contract
- Liberal Approach to Proof of Costs
- Higher Burden of Proof for:
 - Settlement Expense
 - Costs Incurred After Termination

FAR PT 12 CI Contracts

- Cost Principles and CAS Inapplicable
- Proof from Regular Accounting System
- No Govt Audit Rights
- Higher Burden of Proof for:
 - Settlement Expense
 - Costs Incurred After Termination



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



11

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES

6. CLAIM ALL ALLOWABLE COSTS

Traditional Government Contracts

- T/C converts fixed price contract to cost contract
- Contractor entitled to costs up to contract price
 - Contract price = award price + undefinitized equitable adjustments
- No need to show entitlement to equitable adjustments to recover up to contract price

FAR PT 12 CI Contracts

- T/C does not convert to cost contract
- Contract price does not limit prong 2 recovery



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



7. AVOID LOSS ADJUSTMENTS

TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS

- Make government meet burden of proof
 - Must prove loss contract and the amount of loss
 - % of completion analysis is insufficient
 - Contractor is not required to provide EAC or ETC
 - DCAA Audit Manual ¶ 12-307a(3)



FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS

Submit REAs to raise contract price



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



13

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES 8. DON'T LET GOVT LIMIT PROFIT TO THAT BID



- Profit bid a factor of competitive forces
- FAR 15.404-4(b) Favors Structured Approach
 - Early work often entitled to higher profit because:
 - · More difficult
 - Greater risk
- **Estimate at completion ("EAC")** can be used to show what profit would have been if contract was completed



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



9. REQUEST PARTIAL PAYMENT

TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS

- With interim or final settlement proposal
- Consider asking TCO to submit on a total cost basis even if settlement proposal submitted on inventory basis
- Amounts
 - 100% for items completed or to be completed
 - 100% for subcontractor settlements and partial payments
 - 90% of other allowable costs

FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS

- No partial payment provision in FAR PT 12
- Request under FAR 12.210 "Contract financing"



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



15

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES

10. SCHEDULE ALL INVENTORY

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- Plant Clearance Officer ("PCO") is authorized representative of contracting officer
- If contracting officer or PCO accepts inventory the Government bought it
- No requirement to turn over inventory
- CO may request as condition of paying inventory costs
- If contracting officer or PCO accepts inventory the Government likely bought it



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



11. SUBMIT A TIMELY PROPOSAL

TRADITIONAL GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS

- Time limits
 - Prime Contracts
 - 1 year from effective date of termination
 - Partial T/C 90 days to submit equitable adjustment on nonterminated work
 - Subcontracts
 - See subcontract
- Missed deadline = no judicial review

FAR PT 12 COMMERCIAL ITEM CONTRACTS

- No time limit in regulations or CI clause
- Could be time barred by
 - Laches
 - 6 year statute of limitations on submitting claims to CO



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



17

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYGENERAL STRATEGIES 12. OBTAIN PROFESSIONAL HELP



- Arcane legal and accounting issues
- Expertise necessary to maximize recovery
- Professional fees recoverable as settlement expense



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYSPECIFIC COSTS

1. NONCONFORMING WORK

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- Claim cost of defective or nonconforming work
- T/C converts fixed-price contract to cost contract
 - Includes cost for defective or nonconforming work
- Limitation
 - Willful misconduct or gross negligence
- FAR provisions on damaged inventory are inapplicable
 - FAR 49.204 AND 52.249-2, ¶ (G)

- Not compensable under prong 1
- Claim under prong 2 as a reasonable charge resulting from termination
- T/C does not convert to cost contract



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



19

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS 2. CONTRACTOR CAUSE DELAYS

- Worsham Construction Co., ASBCA 25907, 85-2 BCA ¶ 18016
 - "Even assuming . . . delayed performance was caused in part by [the contractor], under the [termination for convenience clause] clause the contractor is entitled to recover all allowable costs."
- Nicon, Inc., 331 F.3d 878 (Fed. Cir. 2003)
 - "If the contractor itself played a role in the delay or if the delay was . . . Beyond the government's control, then there is no entitlement to damages for unabsorbed overhead"



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYSPECIFIC COSTS 3. PRECONTRACT COSTS

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- Rules
 - Precontract costs FAR 31.205-32
 - Allowable "when such incurrence is necessary to comply with proposed delivery schedule"
 - Fair compensation rule FAR 49.201(a)
 - Depends on extent of performance prior to T/C
- Use "Fair Compensation" Principle to Recover Precontract Costs
- Cost principles inapplicable
- Claim under prong 2 as a reasonable charge resulting from termination
- Invoke "fair compensation" principle if necessary



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



21

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS

4. IDLE FACILITIES AND IDLE CAPACITY

Traditional Government Contracts

Pertinent Provisions

- FAR 31.205-17 "Idle Facilities and Idle Capacity and FAR 31.205-42(b) "Costs Continuing After Termination"
- "maintenance, repair, housing, rent, and other related costs, e.g. property taxes, insurance and depreciation"

Bogus DCAA Defenses

- Period claimed > one year
- Facilities not completely idle
- Sales have increased
- The facilities are not special tooling

FAR PT 12 CI Contracts

- Cost principles inapplicable
- Claim under prong 2 as a reasonable charge resulting from termination



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS 6. COMMON ITEMS

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- FAR 31.205(a)
- How to rebut disallowances
 - Demonstrate items cannot be retained at cost without a loss
- Cost principles inapplicable
- Not reasonable to charge for items that can be retained at cost without a loss
- Demonstrate items cannot be retained at cost without a loss



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



23

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS 7. FIRST ARTICLE COSTS

- FAR 52.209-3 "First Article Approval" clause
 - Contractor cannot recover costs for production units it T/C prior to first article exception
- Judicially crafted exceptions
 - Minimum order quantities
 - Waiver
 - First Article subsequently approved
 - Costs also necessary for production articles
 - Long lead time materials necessary to meet delivery schedule MAYBE
 - Switlik Parachute, ASBCA 18,024, 75-2 BCA ¶ 11434 -EXCEPTION
 - "...a contractor is not bound by this risk provision when it would be impossible to wait until first article approval before ordering production materials, and still to meet the delivery schedule."
 - Rex Systems, ASBCA 59,624, 16-1 BCA ¶ 36350 NO EXCEPTION
 - "Although this long lead time concern could explain why Rex initially expected
 to make an early diode order . . . it does not provide us a basis for ignoring the
 plain terms of the contract when determining what compensation is owed to
 Rex for the termination."
- Recovery limited to "total contract price" not first article price



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS

8. G&A ON SUBCONTRACTOR SETTLEMENTS

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- Contractors entitled to G&A on subcontractor settlements
- Don't be misled by the forms
- Cost principles inapplicable
- Claim under prong 2 as a reasonable charge resulting from termination



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



25

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYSPECIFIC COSTS 8. G&A ON SUBCONTRACTOR SETTLEMENTS (cont.)

	SECTION II - PRO	POSED SETTLEME	NT		
NUMBER	ITEM (a)	(Use Columns (previous prop TOTAL PREVIOUSLY PROPOSED (b)	b) and (c) only where osal has been filed) INCREASE OR DECREASE BY THIS PROPOSAL (c)	TOTAL PROPOSED TO DATE (d)	FOR USE OF CONTRACTING AGENCY ONLY (e)
1	METALS				
2	RAW MATERIALS (other than metals)				
3	PURCHASED PARTS				
4	FINISHED COMPONENTS				
5	MISCELLANEOUS INVENTORY				
6	WORK-IN-PROCESS				
7	SPECIAL TOOLING AND SPECIAL TEST EQUIPMENT				
8	OTHER COSTS (from Schedule B)				
9	GENERAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES (from Schedule C)				
10	TOTAL (Items 1 to 9 inclusive)				
11	PROFIT (explain in Schedule D)				
12	SETTLEMENT EXPENSES (from Schedule E)				
13	TOTAL (Items 10 to 12 inclusive)				
14	SETTLEMENTS WITH SUBCONTRACTORS (from Schedule F)				
15	ACCEPTABLE FINISHED PRODUCT				
16	GROSS PROPOSED SETTLEMENT (Items 13 thru 15)				
17	DISPOSAL AND OTHER CREDITS (from Schedule G)				
18	NET PROPOSED SETTLEMENT (Item 16 less 17)				
19	ADVANCE, PROGRESS & PARTIAL PAYMENTS (from Schedule H)				
20	NET PAYMENT REQUESTED (Item 18 less 19)				

AUTHORIZED FOR LOCAL REPRODUCTION

STANDARD FORM 1435 (REV. 3/2016) Prescribed by GSA - FAR (48 CFR) 53.2

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS

9. SETTLEMENT EXPENSE

Traditional Government FAR PT 12 CI Contracts Contracts

- Keep time sheets
- Indirect costs on settlement expense
 - Full burden on outside fees and in-house personnel normally charged direct
 - Reduced burden on in-house personnel normally charged indirect
- Keep time sheets
- Claim with G&A under prong 2 as a reasonable charge resulting from termination



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



27

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC COSTS 10. INTEREST

- Reflectone> Ellet> Rex
- Include REAs in settlement proposal
- Certify and request final decision if Government delays or disputes costs
- Consider filing suit or threatening suit to obtain interest as part of a settlement
- Settlement expense and interest not always an either/or proposition





SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYSPECIFIC CONTRACT TYPES – IDIQ CONTRACTS 1. "LET SLEEPING DOGS LIE"



- Government required to purchase the guaranteed minimum
- Failure to order a breach
 - Entitles contractor to anticipatory profits or in some cases the price of the items not purchased
- Contractor's recovery limited by T/C clause if T/C during contract period
- Therefore, "let sleeping dogs lie"



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



20

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYSPECIFIC CONTRACT TYPES – IDIQ CONTRACTS

2. SUBMIT REA FOR PARTIAL T/C IF MINIMUM NOT MET

T/C clause

 Entitles contractor to equitable adjustment increasing price of nonterminated portion of work

Equitable adjustment

- Computed by increasing price of nonterminated work by costs that would have been recovered in the prices of the terminated work.
- What if Minimum Quantity Satisfied?
 - Deval Corp., ASBCA No. 47132, 95-1 BCA ¶ 27,537
 - Partially terminated contractor entitled to equitable adjustment on nonterminated portion even if minimum quantity purchased if costs of nonterminated work increased





SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY-

SPECIFIC CONTRACT TYPES – SERVICE CONTRACTS BE SURE YOU HAVE THE RIGHT CLAUSE

- FAR 52.249-4 Short Form Service Contracts T/C clause
 - Limits recovery to price of services rendered
 - To be used only when CO reasonably determines no substantial preparation costs
- If short form improperly used it may be judicially replaced by standard clause.
 - DWS, Inc., ASBCA 29742, 90-2 BCA ¶ 22,696





SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



31

TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERY SPECIFIC CONTRACT TYPES – COST TYPE CONTRACTS



Pertinent rules

- Recovery is limited by the LOF clause
- Limitation is waived where contractor is required to turn over *severable* termination inventory resulting from overrun
- T/C may reopen prior cost agreements

Fairness doctrine

- Not in regulations but judicially applied
- Jacobs Eng'g Group, Inc. v. U.S., 434 F.3d 1378 (Fed. Cir. 2006)

Strategy

- Include all severable work in termination inventory
 - If Government accepts severable work, they bought it
- Reopen prior cost agreements after T/C
- Use same strategies as fixed price contract



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com



TRICKS OF THE TRADE – MAXIMIZING CONTRACTOR RECOVERYFURTHER READING

- For a discussion of strategies for maximizing recovery see P. Seidman and D. Seidman, "Maximizing Termination for Convenience Settlements/Edition II – Part I, Briefing Papers 08-03 (Feb. 2008) and 08-05 (Apr. 2008)
 - PT I covers General Strategies
 - PT 2 covers Specific Costs and Contract Types
- For a discussion of evolving case law concerning commercial item terminations see -
 - P. Seidman, "Termination for Convenience of Commercial Item Contracts Is Fair Compensation Required?", 24 N&CR ¶ 37 (Aug. 2010)
 - R. Nash and P. Seidman, "Postscript: Termination for Convenience of Commercial Item Contracts", 25 N&CR ¶ 37 (Aug. 2010)
 - P. Seidman, "Postscript II: Termination for Convenience of Commercial Item Contracts", 29 N&CR ¶ 21 (Apr. 2015)
- · Available at www.seidmanlaw.com

33

THANK YOU QUESTIONS:

Paul J. Seidman
Seidman & Associates, P.C.
Attorneys at Law
1001 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 335
Washington, D.C. 200036

Voice: (202) 737-5734 Facsimile: (202) 204-0001

E-mail: <u>pjseidman@seidmanlaw.com</u>
Website: <u>www.seidmanlaw.com</u>



SEIDMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. www.seidmanlaw.com

